

Dear Douglas,

your *Clariana* looks fine, and sounds fine; undoubtedly.

Of course, each one does make his arrangement to his best knowledge, and the own version settles in one's mind. That is logic.

Also is logic that ~~is~~ another version therefore often evokes mixed feelings. As long as one is ready to accept that one's own version evokes the same mixed feelings with the other adapter, things are in order and of friendly respectfulness.

Now you ask me "a couple of pointers" I shall do that from my own biased point of view. (We will never know how ~~much~~ Bach "fügte von Harmonie so viel dazu bey, als er für nöthig befand")

In general I think that the violin version should be easily recognisable, - also maintaining as much as possible its highs and lows, and also keeping Bach's easy, thin variations as such, in contrast to the opulent ones. Also one should avoid "new" harmonisation, - even if stylistically correct

- Bar 3, alto, last b7: too "new"?
- 8 second beat: Bach has already d major (also bar 16)
- 18 " " a^b, too "new"?
- 23 last chord misprint, I suppose (a)
- 25 onward, Bach writes "thin", - your left hand is opulent.
- 27 first beat, a: too "new"? 29 onward, too low l.h.?
- 33 onward, character changed (too much inner motion? the typical $\frac{7}{8}$ $\frac{7}{8}$ lost)
- 37 l.h. too low? 38 second note rather f?
- 41 l.h. 7 \sharp | oct. higher? 42 ~~second~~ beat idem, 43-l.h. oct higher?
- 48 I should not mind finding Bach's articulation again.
- 50/51 no last note in l.h.? is "simpler"

(This gives already enough of my general thoughts.

77-80 an octave too low?

Another thought: it seems that when Bach was copying his piece into the fine fair copy, he got mixed up in bar 74. What about roughly this:

Handwritten musical notation for two staves, numbered 73 and 74. The notation is in G major (one sharp) and 3/4 time. The first staff is treble clef, the second is bass clef. Bar 73 shows a melodic line in the treble and a bass line. Bar 74 shows a similar melodic line in the treble, but the bass line has a different rhythm and phrasing. Arrows point from the labels "Chord on g" and "Chord on f" to the bass line in bar 74.

Have you any plans to be in Amsterdam?
Please do call then

Myself I shall be in London for a recital
when receiving an award from the Royal
Academy on February 24 (and on April 22
clavichord at Dulwich).

With all best regards,

Jacobus G. Longant